IN THE CIRCUIT COURT, FOURTH JUDICIAL CIRCUIT, IN AND FOR DUVAL COUNTY, FLORIDA

Case No.: 16-2018-CA-001159

Division: CV-E

```
JANE DOE, as Personal
Representative of the Estate of
JOHN DOE, deceased,
            Plaintiff,
                                   )
v.
                                   )
SOUTHERN BAPTIST HOSPITAL OF
FLORIDA, INC., d/b/a BAPTIST
MEDICAL CENTER SOUTH,
REUBEN MAGGARD, M.D.,
BAPTIST PRIMARY CARE, INC.,
SAFEER ASHRAF, M.D., CANCER
SPECIALISTS, L.L.C., JOSE VINDAS-
CORDERO, M.D., FLORIDA CENTER
FOR INFECTIOUS DISEASE, P.A.,
WILLIAM GILL, M.D., KIM PAIK,
A.R.N.P., and RESPIRATORY CRITICAL
CARE & SLEEP MEDICINE
ASSOCIATES, INC.,
           Defendants.
```

ORDER GRANTING IN PART AND DENYING IN PART MOTION TO DETERMINE CONFIDENTIALITY OF COURT DOCUMENTS

This matter came before the Court initially on Plaintiff's Motion to Determine Confidentiality of Court records and subsequently on Defendants' Motion to Vacate Confidentiality order both filed pursuant to Rule 2.420 (e), Florida Rules of Judicial Administration. The Court, having reviewed the Motions, hearing argument of all counsel and being otherwise fully advised in the premises, pursuant to Rule 2.420, Fla. R. Jud. Admin., it is hereby **ORDERED**:

- 1. Plaintiff's Motion to Determine Confidentiality of Court Records is

 GRANTED IN PART AND DENIED IN PART as set forth herein;
- 2. From the entry of this Order and moving forward in all pleadings and Orders entered hereafter, the Personal Representative and the Deceased shall be identified in documents filed in this case only as Jane Doe and John Doe respectively and as set forth in the style of this Order. The caption of this case is hereby amended for such purpose (see also ¶ 3(e), infra);
- 3. Pursuant to Rule 2.420(e)(3), the Court finds the following:
 - a. This is a medical malpractice wrongful death case alleging that the Deceased was not timely diagnosed and treated for his medical condition. This makes his medical condition a matter integral to and inherent in the case. Excluding any reference to his medical condition from records filed with the Court would not be appropriate;



c. Confidentiality is necessary in this case in order to avoid substantial injury to the Personal Representative through the disclosure of matters, protected by a common law or privacy right, incidental to and not generally inherent in the specific type of proceeding sought to be disclosed;

- d. The confidentiality and privacy interests of the personal representative can be fully protected through the use of the pseudonyms (John Doe and Jane Doe, respectively) in place of the name of the Deceased and the Personal Representative;
- e. All documents and records filed in the Court's files prior to the entru of this Order should have the names and/or initials of the Deceased and the Personal Representative redacted, and future filings by the parties should substitute their names and/or initials with the pseudonym John Doe or Jane Doe prior to filing;
- f. Because the Court finds that the substitution of these pseudonyms for the Deceased and for the Personal Representative fully protect the privacy interests of the Personal Representative, any further duty of the parties to comply with the filing of a "Notice of Confidential Information" directing the redaction of information concerning the Deceased's medical condition from any document filed in the record addressed by Rule 2.420(d), Fla. R. Jud. Admin. is hereby excused;

g. The Court further finds that:

- i. The degree, duration and manner of confidentiality ordered by the Court are no broader than necessary to protect the interests set forth in this paragraph (3); and
- ii. No less restrictive measures are available to protect the interests set forth in this paragraph (3);

- h. The use of these pseudonyms in lieu of the names of the Deceased and the Personal Representative is sufficient to protect any privacy interests of the Personal Representative;
- i. The Clerk of Court is directed to publish this Order in accordance with subdivision (e) (4) of Rule 2.420, Fla. R. Jud. Admin.;
 - i. Within 10 days following the entry of the order, the Clerk of
 Court must post a copy of the order on the clerk's website and
 in a prominent public location in the courthouse; and
 - ii. The order must remain in both locations for no less than 30 days;
- 4. The Court directs the Clerk of Court to redact or otherwise remove from all documents already filed in this case the names and/or the initials of the Deceased and the Personal Representative;
- 5. Neither this Order nor the Court file shall be under seal; and
- 6. Nothing in this Order shall impair or impede discovery in the case, the presentation of evidence or argument at trial or in any hearing. Documents filed in the case with pseudonyms only (such as subpoenas for records) may be issued and served with the name of Deceased or the Personal Representative replacing the pseudonym in the body of the document to facilitate the response to and compliance with the subpoena or other document. Consistent with Rule 1.010, Fla. R. Civ. P, it is the Court's intent that the parties cooperate to the fullest extent possible to minimize or eliminate any unintended effects of this

order complicating discovery or the presentation of evidence at trial or any hearing.

- 7. Nothing in this order shall limit or in any manner restrict the sharing of information or documentation by counsel for the parties with their clients (the parties and their agents), their respective experts, consultants, office staff or other agents.
- 8. To the extent Plaintiff requested at the hearing of this matter an order from the Court further finding confidential all references to the subject illness, pertinent tests and/or procedures, said request is **DENIED** as unnecessary in light of the terms of this Order.

DONE AND ORDERED in Chambers at Jacksonville, Duval County, Florida this 20th day of April 2018.

Circuit Judge

Copies to:

Grant Kuvin, Esq.
Morgan & Morgan, PA
76 S. Laura Street
Suite 1100
Jacksonville, FL 32202
gkuvin@forthepeople.com
rpbarnes@forthepeople.com

W. Douglas Childs, Esq. 6022 San Jose Blvd.
Second Floor
Jacksonville, FL 32217
dchilds@childslegalgroup.com
pcreech@childslegalgroup.com
epittman@childslegalgroup.com
cmischung@childslegalgroup.com

Tyler E. Batteese, Esq. 500 N. Westshore Blvd., Suite 630 Tampa, FL 33609 tbatteese@jbfirm.com nhernandez@jbfirm.com

Duke Regan, Esq Hall Booth Smith, PC 200 W. Forsyth Street, Suite 1100 Jacksonville, Florida 32202 dregan@hallboothsmith.com SBarber@hallboothsmith.com

John Bocchino, Esq.
Beytin, McLaughlin, McLaughlin,
O'Hara, Bocchino & Bolin, PA
1063 Maitland Center Commerce Blvd.
Maitland, FL 32751
jwb@law-fla.com
spm@law-fla.com
ych@law-fla.com

Earl E. Googe, Jr., Esq. 225 Water Street, Suite 1800 Jacksonville, Florida 32202 egooge@smithhulsey.commheiden@smithhulsey.comkhettinger@smithhulsey.comdrevell@smithhulsey.com

00994313-2.DOCX